

# **Evaluation of Continuing Medical Education** (CME) Systems across the 27 European Countries

# Tommaso Saita, Pietro Dri

Zadig, Scientific Publisher, Milan, Italy Email: <u>dri@zadig.it</u>

Received 4 March 2014; revised 4 April 2014; accepted 11 April 2014

Copyright © 2014 by authors and Scientific Research Publishing Inc. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY). http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/

© Open Access

## Abstract

The EU Research Project Tell Me aims to create a common communication channel and joint intervention strategies to respond to potential pandemic influenza events. This aim can be supported by using e-learning, which is an increasingly popular approach for continuing medical education. It is characterised by practical and theoretical advantages related to its flexibility, accessibility, adaptability, reduced time and costs and the potential to rapidly disseminate and update educational resources. The aim of this article is to review and identify the policies of continuing medical education systems in Europe. We will specifically focus on e-learning, which may be useful to understand whether there is a favourable evidence and context for the development of a common European continuing medical education e-learning framework. We conducted a survey to collect information about the Continuing Medical Education (CME) system's policy of 27 European Union countries using electronic databases. A CME system is present in 26 of the 27 EU countries. Most of the countries have 1) similar CME system requirements (16), 2) the same accreditation unit (21) and 3) recognize CME distance learning (E-learning) (22). There are still some differences between continuing medical education systems of European countries; however, there is a favourable evidence and context for the development of a common European continuing medical education e-learning framework.

# Keywords

E-Learning, Continuing Medical Education (CME), Continuing Professional Development (CPD), European Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (EACCME), Tell Me Project, Pandemic Situation

How to cite this paper: Saita, T. and Dri, P. (2014). Evaluation of Continuing Medical Education (CME) Systems across the 27 European Countries. *Creative Education*, *5*, 682-689. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.4236/ce.2014.59080</u>

## 1. Introduction

#### **1.1. EU Tell Me Project**

The EU Research "Transparent communication in Epidemics: Learning Lessons from experience, delivering effective Messages, providing Evidence project" (Tell Me project) aims to create a common communication channel and joint intervention strategies to respond to potential pandemic influenza events that would reduce the heterogeneity in tackling the problem between European countries and then optimize the use of available resources. These results can be achieved in particular with e-learning, one of the tools on which the project is centered, and is more cost-effective than classical training.

The EU Tell Me research project involves experts in social and behavioural sciences, communication and media, health professionals at various levels and specialities and representatives of civil society organisations to develop an evidence-based behavioural and communication package to respond to major epidemic outbreaks, notably flu pandemics (Tell Me project, 2012). In order to reach this goal, Tell Me must meet a number of objectives, including the development of an e-learning tool for health workers to rapidly spread information in case of a pandemic situation through all 27 European countries.

## 1.2. Continuing Medical Education and Professional Development

Health operators are constantly required and reminded to update their theoretical, technical and communication skills in order to keep up with the continuous development of medicine and biomedical knowledge, and adhere to requirements for good medical practice (UEMS, 2012).

Hence, it has become essential to support health professionals with lifelong learning initiatives such as continuing medical education (CME) and Continuing Professional Development (CPD) (UEMS, 2012).

As a result, several countries have developed national CME systems to ensure that health professionals would fulfil compulsory learning requirements in order to be able to practice medicine and maintain a high standard of health care.

## 1.3. European Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (EACCME)

Several European countries have developed individual CME systems which may be harmonised via an European initiative. The first step to collate and group these different systems to improve the quality of specialist medical care in Europe was taken by the European Union of Medical Specialists (UEMS, 2012). The UEMS is a non-governmental organisation representing national associations of medical specialists in the European Union and associated countries which has set up the European Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (EACCME). The main aim is to structure and facilitate the mutual recognition of accreditation of CME/CPD activities through the awarding of European CME credits (ECMECs) to individual medical specialists (UEMS, 2012).

However, differences between the CME systems in European countries still persist notwithstanding the recent efforts by UEMS.

#### **1.4. CME E-Learning**

Internet based e-learning is becoming an increasingly recognised approach to CME for practical and theoretical reasons. Compared with traditional face-to-face programs, e-learning platforms offer greater flexibility in training schedules, improved accessibility and dissemination, reduced costs and time, greater adaptability to individual learning styles and easier access to educational material and updates (Fordis, 2005; Cook, 2010). Therefore, e-learning may represent an ideal tool to achieve the primary aims of the EU Tell Me project (see below): to develop a system capable of efficiently disseminating information to health workers across all 27 European Union countries in case of an infectious disease emergency.

## 1.5. Objective

The aim of this article is to review and identify the policies of continuing medical education systems in Europe. The data will inform policy makers and health professionals on the feasibility to develop a common European e-learning tool.

## 2. Methods

#### 2.1. Research

We have conducted an investigation on the Internet to collect information about the Continuing Medical Education (CME) system in the 27 EU countries.

The Ministry of Health's website and CME websites for each country were examined.

In addition, Internet searches were conducted using the Google browser with the following acronyms, keywords and phrases: "CME", "CPD", "continuing medical education", "continuing professional development", "accreditation", "Europe" or "name of the country".

Internet searches were conducted also using keywords in the countries' native language. Most of the sites viewed had the English version; for those which hadn't the English version was used Google Translate tool and the data that were found have been checked crossing available sources.

The review was carried out also using PubMed combining the same keywords ("Education, Medical, Continuing", "accreditation", "European Union"). We included studies published from January 2008 to present. Articles were selected based on their title and abstract. Articles not in English were excluded. Four articles were included in the main analysis (Christodoulou, 2007; Vlassis, 2010; Pardell, 2013; Costa, 2010).

The Health Acts of each European country was examined and relevant information extracted.

Members of the European Union of General Practioners (UEMO) were contacted to obtain additional information on UK, Denmark, Hungary, Germany, Malta, Czech Republic, France, Slovakia and Poland. In addition, we attempted to obtain information from countries with insufficient information on CME systems by directly contacting key members of the national competent CME authority. Requests were sent via email to representatives from 12 countries including: Denmark, Bulgaria, Cyprus, Estonia, Finland, Greece, Hungary, Latvia, Luxemburg, Malta, Portugal and Sweden.

#### 2.2. Research Targets

The information we searched for each country were:

- the presence or absence of a CME system;
- the type of CME system (compulsory, voluntary);
- the CME requirements (number of credits per year);
- the unit of accreditation;
- the learning activities recognised;
- the end-users of the training;
- the participations in UEMS EACCME system;
- the name and the website of the competent CME authority of the country;

These relevant informations have been collected in tables like **Table 1** for each countries.

#### 3. Results and Discussion

Complete information about CME system was obtained from 24 European countries including: Austria (Akademie der arzte, 2010), Belgium (INAMI, 2012), Bulgaria (BLSBG, 2012; BLSBG CME/SDO Department, 2012), Cyprus (Christodoulou, 2007; CyMA, 2012), Czech Republic (ČLK, 2012; ČLK e-learning system, 2012; ČLK Board of Directors, 2012), Denmark (Van Hemelryck, 2009; UEMS. Denmark, 2008b; Lægeforeningen, 2012), Estonia (EAL, 2012), Finland (Finlex Data Bank, 2012; FMA, 2012), France (CNFMC, 2012), Germany (Bundesärztekammer, 2003; Bundesärztekammer, 2004; Bundesärztekammer, 2006; Van Hemelryck, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; Bundesärztekammer, 2012), Greece (UEMS. Greece, 2007; Vlassis, 2010), Hungary (MOTESZ, 2006; MOTESZ, 2012), Ireland (Van Hemelryck, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; RCPI, 2011; RCPI, 2012), Italy (Van Hemelryck, 2009; Agenas, 2010; Murgatroyd, 2011; Agenas, 2012), Latvia (Van Hemelryck, 2009; LAB, 2012), Lithuania (Van Hemelryck, 2009; SMM, 2009; VASPVT, 2012), Netherlands (UEMS. Netherlands, 2008a; Van Hemelryck, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; KNMG, 2012a, b), Poland (Van Hemelryck, 2009; NIL, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; NIL, 2012), Portugal (UEMS. Portugal, 2008d; Van Hemelryck, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; SACCME, 2012), Slovenia (Van Hemelryck, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; ZZS, 2012), Spain (Pardell, 2008; Van Hemelryck, 2009; Costa, 2010; Murgatroyd, 2011; SEAFORMEC, 2012; Agencia estatal, 2012; Pardell, 2013),

	Details of the information collected		
Country	EU Member State		
Presence of CME System	Presence/absence of a CME system (date)		
CME compulsory	Mandatory/optional CME system (date)		
CME system requirements	Organization and requirements of the CME system		
CME credits (unit)	Measurement of credits		
Recognised types of CME activities	Recognised types of CME activities such as E-learning		
CME target	Target of the continuing education programme (e.g., doctors, nurses)		
Participation in the UEMS EACCME system	Whether the system participates in the UEMS EACCME system		
Name of the competent CME authority	Details of the CME authority		
Website	Web link		

 Table 1. Example of a table used for collecting information on the CME system of each country.

Sweden (Van Hemelryck, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; IPULS, 2012), and United Kingdom (Van Hemelryck, 2009; RCP, 2011; RCP, 2012). For the three remaining countries (Lithuania, Luxembourg and Malta) partial information were found (UEMS. Luxembourg, 2008c; Van Hemelryck, 2009; SMM, 2009; Murgatroyd, 2011; VASPVT, 2012; Institut FMC, 2012; ALFORMEC, 2012; MAM, 2012).

**Table 2** summarises the results of the research according to six fundamental categories: 1) the presence or absence of a CME system, 2) the CME requirements (compulsory, voluntary), 3) the number of credits per year, 4) the unit of accreditation, 5) the recognition of e-learning and 6) the target of CME.

The 27 countries are full members of UEMS and follow the EACCME directive. While there are various types of CME systems in each country, with some systems still in early development, the results suggest the existence of a common European framework (UEMS). The UEMS represents an important attempt to reduce the heterogeneity across the different CME systems.

A CME system is present in 26 EU countries (96%), but some systems do not have a format based on credits system (11%).

More than half of countries (15 countries, 56%) are characterised by a mandatory participation to their CME system. In the remaining countries participation is voluntary and based on the assumption that CME is a civic duty and, in some cases, participation is encouraged by either tax incentives or financial rewards.

There is a reasonable homogeneity in the type of CME system across countries and for most of them (15 countries) it can be divided into two main types:

- CME system with a five years cycle for a total of 200/250 credits (11 countries);

- CME system with a three years cycle for a total of 150 credits (5 countries).

The remaining CME systems are somewhat different including for example, a five years cycle for a total of 100/120 credits, and a system requiring 75 credits in seven years (Slovenia).

However, among the countries that provide CME credits (21 countries), the majority of these (16) requires healthcare operators to acquire 40 to 60 credits per year.

The case of Sweden is unique since the CME system is not based on credits. Details on the CME system were not available for Luxembourg, Malta, Portugal and Spain.

A large homogeneity on the accreditation unit across countries was observed. Specifically, 14 countries award one credit for one hour of activity and 6 countries award one credit for 45 minutes of activity. Information on accreditation unit was not available for the remaining 4 countries with a system based on credits. In addition, if we assume that 45 minutes are equal to an hour of training, all the countries with a system based on credits (21) utilises the same accreditation unit.

The type of activities accepted for credit across all 27 European Union countries includes: 1) internal/external activities, 2) publications and 3) referee duties. Distance learning (E-learning) was recognized for the acquisition of credits in 22 countries (81%) and not recognized in Greece and Estonia. Three countries (Luxembourg, Malta and Portugal) did not provide information on accepted activities for accreditation.

CountryPresence of a CME systemCME requirementCredit/yearCME cordits (cordits/minutes)E-dening recognizedCME targetAustriaYesCompulsory150/31/45 minYesAll medical doctorsBulgariaYesCompulsory150/31/45 minYesAll medical doctorsCyprusYesVoluntary150/31/40 minYesAll medical doctorsCyprusYesCompulsory120/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsDenmarkYesVoluntary200/51/45 minNesAll medical doctorsDenmarkYesVoluntary300/51/45 minNoAll medical doctorsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctorsGermanyYesCompulsory150/31/45-60 minYesAll medical doctorsfranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctorsfungaryYesCompulsory250/51/460 minYesAll medical doctorsfungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsfutalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsfutalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsfutalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsfutalyYesCompulsory250	Table 2. Synthesis of information collected by the research about European CME systems.								
BelgiumYesVulurary60/31/60 minYesAll medical doctorsBulgariaYesCompulsory150/31/45 minYesAll medical doctorsCyprusYesVoluntary150/31/60 minYesAll medical doctorsCzech RepublicYesCompulsory120/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsDenmarkYesVoluntary200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsEstoniaYesVoluntaryNot based-YesAll medical doctorsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital primacistsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital primacistsGermanyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital primacistsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory120/5NANANAMaliaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesItalyaYesCompulsory120/5NANANAMaliaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYe	Country			Credit/year			CME target		
BulgariaYesCompulsory15031/45 minYesAll medical doctorsCypusYesVoluntary15031/60 minYesAll medical doctorsCzech RepublicYesCompulsory120/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsDenmarkYesVoluntary200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsEstoniaYesVoluntary300 51/45 minNoAll medical doctorsFinlandNoVoluntaryNo1/45 minNoAll medical doctorsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsMaltaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsMalta <td>Austria</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Compulsory</td> <td>150/3</td> <td>1/45 min</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>All medical doctors</td>	Austria	Yes	Compulsory	150/3	1/45 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
CypusYesVoluntary1503160 minYesAll medical doctorsCzech RepublicYesCompulsory120/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsDemmarkYesVoluntary200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsEstoniaYesVoluntary300/51/45 minNoAll medical doctorsFinlandNoVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctorsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctorsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsGereaeYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors<	Belgium	Yes	Voluntary	60/3	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
Creek PermarkYesCompulsory120/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsDenmarkYesVoluntary200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsEstoniaYesVoluntary300/51/45 minNoAll medical doctorsFinlandNoVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctors, definitis and hospital pharmacistsFranceYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctors, definitis and hospital pharmacistsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctors, definits and hospital pharmacistsGreeceYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors definits, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors definits, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors definits, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al the bealth professionalsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al the bealth professionalsItalyYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors and credital doctorsMaltaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYes<	Bulgaria	Yes	Compulsory	150/3	1/45 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
Denmark EstoniaYesVoluntary200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsEstoniaYesVoluntaryNot based on credits.YesAll medical doctorsFinlandNoVoluntaryNot based on credits.YesAll medical doctorsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital pharmacistsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital pharmacistsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists pharmacistsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists pharmacistsItelandYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists pharmacistsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctorsMallaYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctorsMallaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 min	Cyprus	Yes	Voluntary	150/3	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
EstoniaYesVoluntary300/51/45 minNoAll medical doctors dentists and hospital pharmacistsFinlandNoVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctors dentists and hospital pharmacistsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital pharmacistsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctors dentists, pharmacists and clinists, pharmacistsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotnerspist, midvives and ansesNetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsNetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsNetherlandsYesCompulsory <td>Czech Republic</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Compulsory</td> <td>120/5</td> <td>1/45 min</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>All medical doctors</td>	Czech Republic	Yes	Compulsory	120/5	1/45 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
FinlandNoVoluntaryNot based on creditsYesAll medical doctors, All medical doctors, dentists and hospital pharmacistsFranceYesCompulsory1503 - 250'51/45 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and hospital pharmacistsGermanyYesCompulsory1503 - 250'51/45 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists, nahmacistsGerceceYesVoluntary100'5NANoAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsHungaryYesCompulsory250'51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsIrelandYesCompulsory250'51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory150'31/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory120'5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, midvices and nursesNetherlandsYesCompulsory200'51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, midvices and ansists, midvices and ansistants in learing activityNetherlandsYesCompulsory200'51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, midvices and actistsPol	Denmark	Yes	Voluntary	200/5	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
FindandNoVoluntary on credits-YesAll medical doctors all medical doctorsFranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesAll medical doctors alpharmacistsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctors of the stand hospital pharmacistsGreeceYesVoluntary100/5NANoAll medical doctors All medical doctorsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al doctists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsIrelandYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al dentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al inclinical psychologistsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al inclinical psychologistsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors al inclinical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and markets, physiotherapists, midwives and anusesNetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsNetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medica	Estonia	Yes	Voluntary	300/5	1/45 min	No	All medical doctors		
FranceYesCompulsory250/51/45-60 minYesdentists and hospital pharmacistsGermanyYesCompulsory150/3 - 250/51/45 minYesAll medical doctorsGreeceYesVoluntary100/5NANoAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and logistsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and logistsIrelandYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and logistsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory120/5NANANAMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANAMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANANetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacists, pharmacist, ph	Finland	No	Voluntary		-	Yes	All medical doctors		
GreeceYesVoluntary100/5NANoAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsHungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsIrelandYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory150/31/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory120/5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, midwives and nursesNetherlandsYesVoluntaryNANANANANetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPolandYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySlovakiaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory250	France	Yes	Compulsory	250/5	1/45-60 min	Yes	dentists and hospital		
HungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists and clinical psychologistsIrelandYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory150/31/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory120/5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, medical doctors, physiotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, healthcare psychologists, midvives and nursesYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsAll medical doctors and invives and nursesSlovakiaYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySlovakiaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySlovakiaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical do	Germany	Yes	Compulsory	150/3 - 250/5	1/45 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
HungaryYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesdentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologistsIrelandYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsItalyYesCompulsory150/31/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLatviaYesCompulsory120/5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, entists, dentists, dentists, dentists, entists, dentists, dentist, dentists, dentist, dentists, dentist, dentists, dentist, dentists, dentist, dentist, dentists, dentist, de	Greece	Yes	Voluntary	100/5	NA	No	All medical doctors		
ItalyYesCompulsory150/31/60 minYesAll the health professionalsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLithuaniaYesCompulsory120/5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctorsMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, heithcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, heithcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, heithcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, heithcare psychologists, psychotherapists, heithcare psychologists, psychotherapists, midwives and assistants in learning activityAll medical doctorsPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsPortugalYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySlovakiaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSloveniaYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctors advives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesVoluntaryNot based<	Hungary	Yes	Compulsory	250/5	1/60 min	Yes	dentists, pharmacists and		
ItalyYesCompulsory150/31/60 minYesprofessionalsLatviaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsLithuaniaYesCompulsory120/5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctorsMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, of neathcare psychologists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPotugalYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors dentists, midwives and and assistants in learning activitySlovakiaYesVoluntary200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentistSlovakiaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentistSlovakiaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist in learning activitySlovakiaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist in learning activitySloveniaYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAl	Ireland	Yes	Compulsory	250/5	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
LithuaniaYesCompulsory120/5NAYesAll medical doctorsLuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctorsMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANAGeneral practitionersMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANAAll medical doctors, phymacists, physiotherapists, heathcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesAll medical doctors, physiotherapists, dentists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsPortugalYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, and dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySlovakiaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistSpainYesVoluntaryNA $1 \ \ \ Staccme = 0.12 \$	Italy	Yes	Compulsory	150/3	1/60 min	Yes			
LuxembourgYesVoluntaryNANANANAAll medical doctorsMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANANAGeneral practitionersMaltaYesVoluntaryNANANANAAll medical doctors, pharmacists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midvives and nursesNetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPortugalYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctors, dentistsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctors	Latvia	Yes	Compulsory	250/5	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
MaltaYesVoluntaryNANANANAGeneral practitioners pharmacists, physiotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesNetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, physiotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPortugalYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctors dentistsRomaniaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors dentistsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesVoluntaryNA1ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctors	Lithuania	Yes	Compulsory	120/5	NA	Yes	All medical doctors		
NetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, pharmacists, physiotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPortugalYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctorsRomaniaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsSlovakiaYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctors, dentistsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-YesAll medical doctors	Luxembourg	Yes	Voluntary	NA	NA	NA	All medical doctors		
NetherlandsYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYespharmacists, physiotherapists, physiotherapists, dentists, midwives and nursesPolandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsPortugalYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctorsRomaniaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsSlovakiaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentists, midwives and assistantsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, and dentistsSloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA $\frac{1 ECMEC credit = 0.12}{SACCME}$ YesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Malta	Yes	Voluntary	NA	NA	NA	General practitioners		
PotandYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesdentistsPortugalYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-NoAll medical doctorsRomaniaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Netherlands	Yes	Compulsory	200/5	1/60 min	Yes	pharmacists, physiotherapists, healthcare psychologists, psychotherapists, dentists,		
PortugalYesVoluntary on credits-NoAll medical doctorsRomaniaYesCompulsory200/51/60 minYesAll medical doctorsSlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Poland	Yes	Compulsory	200/5	1/60 min	Yes			
SlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors, dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Portugal	Yes	Voluntary		-	No	All medical doctors		
SlovakiaYesVoluntary250/51/60 minYesdentist, nurses, midwives and assistants in learning activitySloveniaYesCompulsory75/71/60 minYesAll medical doctors and dentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Romania	Yes	Compulsory	200/5	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		
StoveniaYesComputatory75771760 minYesdentistsSpainYesVoluntaryNA1 ECMEC credit = 0.12 SACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Slovakia	Yes	Voluntary	250/5	1/60 min	Yes	dentist, nurses, midwives and assistants		
SpainYesVoluntaryNASACCMEYesAll medical doctorsSwedenYesVoluntaryNot based on credits-Yes-	Slovenia	Yes	Compulsory	75/7	1/60 min	Yes			
Sweden Yes Voluntary on credits - Yes -	Spain	Yes	Voluntary	NA		Yes	All medical doctors		
United KingdomYesCompulsory250/51/60 minYesAll medical doctors	Sweden	Yes	Voluntary		-	Yes	-		
	United Kingdom	Yes	Compulsory	250/5	1/60 min	Yes	All medical doctors		

 Table 2. Synthesis of information collected by the research about European CME systems

Most CME systems (17 countries) are targeted to medical doctors (all specialties). Seven countries, Italy included, have a CME system open to other health operators (i.e. nurses, obstetricians, pharmacists and so on). Italy in particular is the only European country in which all health operators are obliged to enrol in a continuing medical education programme.

## 4. Conclusions

The results show there is a lack of standardisation between European countries' CME systems and the development of a protocol of e-learning that could be consistently applied in different countries is warranted.

Most countries have CME systems with similar accreditation systems, recognize distance learning and have mutually recognized credits because they adhere to a common system (UEMS).

A potential limitation is that most CME systems are targeted only to medical doctors. However, global events requiring organized actions (which is the primary focus of the Tell Me Project) may require the involvement of different health operators who would be expected to follow specific training recommendations. Numerous health training activities are now operating in different countries which may need to be incorporated into each accreditation system and taken into account in case of a coordinated European action to rapidly spread information in case of a pandemic situation.

Few studies have reported a complete overview of the CME system in the 27 EU countries and this article may provide a useful update of the existing literature.

## Acknowledgements

This report has been produced as a study of feasibility for an online course for primary care staff in the context of the European Project Tell Me-Transparent communication in Epidemics: Learning Lessons from experience, delivering effective Messages, providing Evidence (http://tellmeproject.eu).

#### References

Agencia estatal (2012). Boletín oficial del estado (BOE) núm. 81. http://www.boe.es/boe/dias/2007/04/04/pdfs/A14765-14800.pdf

Agenzia nazionale per i servizi sanitari regionali (Agenas), National Agency for Regional Health Services (2010). Criteri per l'assegnazione dei crediti alle attività ECM approvato dalla Commissione nazionale per la formazione continua. http://ape.agenas.it/documenti/2.criteri per assegnazione crediti e fsc.pdf

Agenzia nazionale per i servizi sanitari regionali (Agenas), National Agency for Regional Health Services (2012). http://www.agenas.it

Akademie der arzte (2010). CPD (Continuing Professional Development) Regulations. http://www.arztakademie.at

Association Luxembourgeoise pour la Formation Mèdicale Continue (ALFORMEC) Association for Continuing Medical Education of Luxemburg (2012). <u>http://www.alformec.lu</u>

Bulgarian Medical Association (BLSBG) CME/SDO Department (2012). Mail sdobls@abv.bg

Bulgarian Medical Association (BLSBG) (2012). http://www.blsbg.com

Bundesärztekammer, German federal Medical Association. (2004). Regulations Continuing Medical Education Certificate. http://www.bundesaerztekammer.de/downloads/ADFBSatzungEn.pdf

Bundesärztekammer, German Federal Medical Association (2012). http://www.bundesaerztekammer.de

- Bundesärztekammer, German Medical Association (2003). Social Health Insurance Modernisation Act. http://www.bundesaerztekammer.de
- Bundesärztekammer (2006). Order of 13 July 2006 Approving the Validation Rules CME. http://www.bundesaerztekammer.de
- Česká lékařská komora (ČLK) Czech Medical Chamber (2012). http://www.lkcr.cz
- Christodoulou, N. (2007). Continuing Medical Education and Continuing Professional Development in the Mediterranean Countries. *Eura Medicophys*, *43*, 195-202. <u>http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/17589412</u>
- Colegiul Medicilor din Romania (CMR), Romanian College of Physicians (2011). National Continuing Medical Education Program. (Colegiul medicilor din romania, departamentul profesional stiintific, programul national de educatie medicala continua). <u>http://www.amf-b.ro</u>

Colegiul Medicilor din Romania (CMR), Romanian College of Physicians (2012). http://www.cmr.ro

- Conseils Nationaux de la Formation Médicale Continue (CNFMC) (2012). National Councils for Continuing Medical Education. <u>http://www.cnfmc.fr</u>
- Cook, D. A., Levinson, A. J., Garside, S., Dupras, D. M., Erwin, P. J., & Montori, V. M. (2010). Internet-Based Learning in the Health Professions: A Meta-Analysis. *Journal of the American Medical Association, 300*, 1181-1196. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jama.300.10.1181</u>
- Costa, A., Van Hemelryck, F., Aparicio, A., Gatzemeier, W., Leer, J. W., Maillet, B., & Hossfeld, D. K. (2010). Continuing Medical Education in Europe: Towards a Harmonised System. *European Journal of Cancer, 46,* 2340-2343. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ejca.2010.05.029

Cyprus Medical Association (CyMA) (2012). http://www.cyma.org.cy

Česká lékařská komora (ČLK), Czech Medical Chamber, E-Learning System (2012) http://www.eclk.cz

Eesti Arstide Liit (EAL), Estonian Medical Association (2012). http://www.arstideliit.ee

European Union of Medical Specialists (UEMS) (2012). http://www.uems.net/index.php?id=32

Finlex Data Bank (2012). http://www.finlex.fi

Fordis, M., King, J., Ballantyne, C. M. et al. (2005). Comparison of the Instructional Efficacy of Internet-Based CME with Live Interactive CME Workshops. A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Journal of the American Medical Association, 294*, 1043-1051. <u>http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/16145024</u> <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jama.294.9.1043</u>

Institut Luxembourgeois pour la Formation Médicale Continue (Institut FMC) Institute for Continuing Medical Education of Luxembourg (2012). <a href="http://www.institutfmc.lu">http://www.institutfmc.lu</a>

Institut National d'Assurance Maladie Invalidité (INAMI), National Institute for Sickness and Invalidity (2012). http://www.inami.fgov.be

Institute for Professional Development of Physicians in Sweden (IPULS) (2012). http://www.ipuls.se

- Koninklijke Nederlandsche Maatschappij tot bevordering der Geneeskunst (KNMG) Royal Dutch Medical Association (2012a). The Accreditation Board Cluster 1. <u>http://www.cvah.net</u>
- Koninklijke Nederlandsche Maatschappij tot bevordering der Geneeskunst (KNMG) Royal Dutch Medical Association (2012b). <u>http://knmg.artsennet.nl</u>
- Lægeforeningen, Danish Medical Association (LAEGER) (2012). http://www.laeger.dk

Latvijas Ārstu Biedrība (LAB), Latvian Medical Association (2012). http://www.arstubiedriba.lv

- Magyar Orvostársaságok és Egyesületek Szövetsége (MOTESZ), Hungarian Medical Association. (2006). Amendment of Regulation 52/2003 (VIII 22) on the training of doctors, dentists, pharmacists and clinical psychologists. (51/2006. (XII. 28.) EüM rendelet az orvosok, fogorvosok, gyógyszerészek és klinikai szakpszichológusok folyamatos továbbképzéséről szóló 52/2003. (VIII. 22.) ESzCsM rendelet módosításáról). <u>http://www.motesz.hu</u>
- Magyar Orvostársaságok és Egyesületek Szövetsége (MOTESZ), Hungarian Medical Association (2012). http://www.motesz.hu
- Murgatroyd, G. B. (2011). Continuing Professional Development: The International Perspective. General Medic Council. http://www.gmc-uk.org/CPD The International Perspective Jul 11.pdf 44810902.pdf
- Naczelna Izba Lekarska (NIL), Polish Chamber of Physicians (2009). Bureau of the Supreme Medical Council, Appendix 1 to Resolution 52/04/PV of 24 April 2009 on the mode of operation of the Centre for Medical Training CED Polish Chamber of Physicians mode of operation of the Centre for Vocational Dental Practitioners Physicians and the Polish Chamber of Physicians and Dentists. (Zalacznik nr 1 do Uchwaly 52/04/P-V Prezydium Naczelnej Rady Lekarskiej z dnia 24 kwietnia 2009 w sprawie trybu dzialania Osrodka Doskonalenia Zawodowego Lekarzy i Lekarzy Dentystów Naczelnej Izby Lekarskiej). http://www.nil.org.pl/ data/assets/pdf file/0005/7745/pu-52-09-tryb-dzialania-ODZ-zal.pdf

Naczelna Izba Lekarska (NIL), Polish Chamber of Physicians (2012). http://www.nil.org.pl

- Pardell, H. (2008). CME and CME Accreditation in Spain. <u>http://www.europeancmeforum.eu/ecf2008/presentations/1\_hpardell.pdf</u>
- Pardell, H., & Sierra, G. (2003). Continuing Medical Education and Continuing Medical Education Accreditation in Spain. *The Journal of Continuing Education in the Health Professions, 23*, 244-246. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/chp.1340230508</u>

Royal College of Physicians (RCP) (2012). http://www.rcplondon.ac.uk

Royal College of Physicians of Ireland (RCPI) (2011). Professional Competence Scheme. <u>http://www.rcpi.ie/PC/Documents/ICHMT/ICHMT%20Professional%20Competence%20Scheme%20-%20General%20D</u> <u>ivision.pdf</u>

Royal College of Physicians of Ireland (RCPI) (2012). http://www.rcpi.ie

CGCOM (2012). Sistema Español de Acreditación de la Formación Médica Continuada (SEAFORMEC). http://www.cgcom.es/seaformec

- Slovenská akreditačná rada pre kontinuálne vzdelávanie, Slovak Accreditation Council for CME (SACCME) (2008). Continuing medical education (CME). (Slovenská akreditaãná rada pre kontinuálne medicínske vzdelávanieãlen Európskej akreditaãnej rady CME, kontinuálne medicínske vzdelávanie v sr (CME)). http://www.saccme.sk/sites/default/files/bulletin SACME 2008.pdf
- Slovenská akreditačná rada pre kontinuálne vzdelávanie, Slovak Accreditation Council for CME (SACCME) (2012). http://www.saccme.sk

Suomen Lääkäriliitto, Finnish Medical Association (FMA) (2012). Mail fma@laakariliitto.fi

- Švietimo ir mokslo ministerija (SMM) Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Lithuania (2009). http://www.smm.lt/prtm/p\_reng/docs/VET-pranesimas-LT-2010.pdf
- Česká lékařská komora (ČLK), Czech Medical Chamber, Board of Directors (2012). Professional Regulation n. 16. http://www.lkcr.cz/doc/cms\_library/sp16-novela-17-112012-100504.pdf
- The Continuing Professional Development (CPD) Office of the Federation of Royal Colleges of Physicians of the UK (RCP) (2011). Continuing Professional Development. <u>http://www.rcseng.ac.uk/surgeons/working/docs/cpd-guidance</u>
- The Medical Association of Malta (MAM) (2012). http://www.mam.org.mt
- Tell Me (2012). Transparent Communication in Epidemics: Learning Lessons from Experience, Delivering Effective Messages, Providing Evidence (Tell Me). <u>http://tellmeproject.eu/</u>
- UEMS (2008a). Netherlands. http://www.ipcaa.org/assets/Netherlands42818.pdf
- UEMS (2008b). Denmark. http://www.ipcaa.org/assets/Denmark86423.pdf
- UEMS (2007). Greece. http://www.ipcaa.org/assets/Greece77669.pdf
- UEMS (2008c). Luxembourg. http://www.ipcaa.org/assets/Luxembourg44760.pdf
- UEMS (2008d). Portugal. http://www.ipcaa.org/assets/Portugal81875.pdf
- Valstybinė akreditavimo sveikatos priežiūros veiklai tarnyba (VASPVT) State Health Care Accreditation Agency (2012). http://www.vaspvt.gov.lt/node/168
- Van Hemelryck, F. (2009). Continuing Medical Education (CME) in Europe. A Survey of the Situation in the 27 EU Member States.

http://www.acoe.be/~/media/ECCO%20documents/ACOE/Apply%20for%20accreditation/SurveyresultsSeptember09.pdf Vlassis, N. P. (2010). More Is Not Better: Concerning Congresses. *The Hellenic Journal of Cardiology*, *51*, 189-191.

http://www.hellenicjcardiol.com/archive/full\_text/2010/2/2010\_2\_189.pdf

Zdravniška zbornica Slovenije (ZZS), Slovenian Medical Chamber (2012). http://www.zzs-mcs.si